



# Al-Dakhil in Tafsir Al-Mishbah by Muhammad Quraish Shihab (Critical Study of the Tafsir of Surah Maryam)

Fefi Nurul Aini<sup>1</sup>, Nurfajiani<sup>2</sup>, Suhefri<sup>3</sup>, Muhammad Irfan<sup>1</sup>, Syukree Langputeh<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>STAI Pengembangan Ilmu Al-Qur'an Sumatera Barat, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>STAIN Bengkalis Riau, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>Universitas Islam Negeri Imam Bonjol Padang, Indonesia

<sup>4</sup>Fatori University, Thailand

✉ [fefinurulaini@gmail.com](mailto:fefinurulaini@gmail.com) \*

## Article Information:

Received March 17, 2024

Revised April 20, 2024

Accepted July 5, 2024

**Keywords:** *Ad-Dakhil, Tafsir Al-Mishbah, Surah Maryam*

## Abstract

This research was motivated by indications of deviations and controversies in several interpretations of Surah Maryam in Tafsir Al-Mishbah by Muhammad Quraish Shihab. The research aims to analyze cases of al-dakhil contained in Surah Maryam, including the story of the wife of the Prophet Zakariyya a.s., the date of birth of the Prophet Isa a.s., the suspicion that Maryam was Harun's sister, views on Christmas greetings, and the Prophet Ibrahim a.s.'s request for forgiveness to his father. Using qualitative methods based on library research, using the Al-Qur'an, Tafsir books and other supporting literature as data sources. The research results show that there is al-dakhil in the form of bi al-ma'tsur, such as the story of isra'iliyyat (Q.S. Maryam: 2), and bi al-ra'y, such as the age of the Prophet Zakariyya AS. (Q.S. Maryam: 8), controversy over the birth of the Prophet Isa a.s. (Q.S. Maryam: 24-25), and the debate about Christmas (Q.S. Maryam: 33). The analysis shows Quraish Shihab's lack of caution in dealing with the history and influence of references from controversial figures.

## How to cite:

Aini, F. N., Nurfajiani, Suhefri, Irfan, M., (2024). Al-Dakhil in Tafsir Al-Mishbah by Muhammad Quraish Shihab (Critical Study of the Tafsir of Surah Maryam)., *Al-Misbah: Journal of the Quran, Hadith and Tafseer* 1(2), 26–33.

## E-ISSN:

XXXX-XXXX

## Published by:

The Institute for Research and Community Service

## INTRODUCTION

Interpretation is a particular pattern, direction, or pattern of thinking that is the dominant characteristic in a work of interpretation (Abdullah, 2017; Atabik, 2016; Hasanah et al., 2022; Hasibuan et al., 2020; Purwaningrum & Muhammad, 2022). In the study, there is not a single mufassir who is completely free from the possibility of errors in interpreting verses of the Qur'an. This has become increasingly complex in the modern era, where many interpretations are influenced by the subjective interests of the interpreter. As time progresses, this has given rise to a diversity of interpretations, which on the one hand constitutes intellectual property, but on the other hand gives rise to potential deviations in the product of interpretive books. Deviations in interpretation, namely including invalid data in the discussion of the Al-Qur'an, the book of tafsir, are known as al-dakhil (Akbar & Riyadi, 2022; Sulthoni, 2019; Ulinnuha, 2017).

One of the tafsir books which allegedly contains al-dakhil is Tafsir al-Mishbah which is very popular in Indonesia. This tafsir is the work of Muhammad Quraish Shihab (Mujahidin & Khoiriyah, 2018; Musa, 2024; Rif'ah, 2023). This tafsir uses the tahlili method with the Adabu al Ijtima'i pattern. Namely connecting the verses of the Koran with the social and cultural realities of society. This style does not only involve lughawi, fiqh, or scientific interpretation, but also emphasizes the relevance of interpretation to the social and cultural needs of society (Aisyah, 2021; Sholihah et al., 2024).

Based on these advantages, this book is often used as a reference by Indonesian people in understanding the Koran. However, despite its popularity, this book also contains a number of narrations which are considered not in accordance with the rules of interpretation, such as israiliyyat stories which do not have valid arguments, the use of invalid narrations, as well as dha'if hadiths or without proper narrators. clear. One example is when M. Quraish Shihab interpreted Surah Maryam verse 2 as follows:

ذَكَرُ رَحْمَتِ رَبِّكَ عَبْدَهُ زَكَرِيَّا

*"(What is read is) an explanation of the mercy of your Lord to His servant, Zakaria," (Maryam/19:2).*

In interpreting this verse, Muhammad Quraish Shihab explained the identity of Prophet Zakariyya a.s. According to him, "What is meant by Zakariyya here is the Prophet Zakariyya AS, a Jewish religious leader. In the Old Testament it is said that he married a woman named Elizabeth, who was related to Maryam AS." (Shihab, 2017)

Based on the author's analysis, Quraish Shihab's interpretation of the statement above can be categorized into al-dakhil bi al-ma'tsur. This is because the story is part of the israiliyyat story whose truth cannot be ascertained and is not supported by other scientific arguments.

There are three things that form the basis of the author's question:

First, to what extent is the urgency in quoting commentaries from the Old Testament? Second, hasn't Allah SWT explained that the books of the Old and New Testaments are no longer original, as is clearly seen in surah al-Baqarah verse 79:

فَوَيْلٌ لِلَّذِينَ يَكْتُوبُونَ الْكِتَابَ بِأَيْدِيهِمْ ثُمَّ يَقُولُونَ هَذَا مِنْ عِنْدِ اللَّهِ لِيَسْتَرُوا بِهِ ثَمًّا قَلِيلًا  
فَوَيْلٌ لَهُمْ مِمَّا كَتَبَتْ أَيْدِيهِمْ وَوَيْلٌ لَهُمْ مِمَّا يَكْسِبُونَ

*"Woe to those who write books with their (own) hands, then say, "This is from Allah," (with the intention) of selling it cheaply. So, woe to them because of what their hands write and woe to them because of what they do." (Al-Baqarah/2:79)*

Third, aren't the Children of Israel themselves no longer interested in and no longer willing to be bound by their Holy Book? As Allah SWT. mentioned in surah al-Maidah verse 43:

وَكَيْفَ يُحَكِّمُونَكَ وَعِنْدَهُمُ التَّوْرَةُ فِيهَا حُكْمُ اللَّهِ ثُمَّ يَتَوَلَّوْنَ مِنْ بَعْدِ ذَلِكَ وَمَا أُولَئِكَ  
بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ □

“How did they make you their judge, when they have the Torah which contains (there is) Allah's law, then they turned away (from your decision) after that? They really are not believers.” (Al-Ma'idah/5:43)

This phenomenon raises questions, especially regarding Muhammad Quraish Shihab's decision to refer to the Old Testament or Torah, including in the israiliyyat stories. Records show that the book *Tafsir al-Mishbāh* quotes the Old Testament 65 times (Nur, 2018). This is an important concern in the analysis of this interpretation.

In compiling this research, the author found several previous studies that discussed similar topics, although with different focuses and approaches. The first research was a thesis by Nora Idola entitled *Al-Dakhīl in Tafsir Al-Mishbāh* by M. Quraish Shihab (Perspective Study of Story Verses and Laws). Nora discusses *al-dakhīl* in *Tafsir al-Mishbāh* with a focus on legal verses such as Surah al-Nur verse 31 and Surah al-Insan verse 8, as well as narrative verses such as Surah Shad verses 23-25 and Surah al-Hajj verse 53 (Idol, 2022). The difference with this research is that the scope of the discussion is broader, whereas this research only focuses on *al-dakhīl* in Surah Maryam. The second research is Fauziah's thesis with the title *Al-Dakhīl in Tafsir Al-Khazin* (Analysis of *Al-Dakhīl* in Story Verses in Surah An-Naml) which discusses the form and history of *al-dakhīl* in *tafsir al-Qur'an* with a focus on *Tafsir al-Khazin* in Surah An-Naml (Fauziah, 2018). This research is different because Fauziah studied *Tafsir al-Khazin*, while this research studied *Tafsir al-Mishbāh*.

The third research is a thesis by Nur Fadilah M. E entitled *Al-Dakhīl in Tafsir Al-Ibriz* by Bisri Mustafa (Analytical Study of QS. Al-Kahf and QS. Maryam) Nur Fadilah examines *al-dakhīl* in *Tafsir al-Ibriz* with a focus on the stories in Surah al-Kahf and Surah Maryam, such as the story of Diqyanus and Ashāb al-Kahf, as well as the lineage of the Prophet Idris. Some narrations are classified as *israiliyyat mardūd* (rejected) or *mauqūf* (allowed) (Efha, 2019). This research is different because it focuses on *Tafsir al-Mishbāh* and Surah Maryam, and includes other verses outside of the particular stories. This shows that this research has a specific and in-depth scope in discussing *al-dakhīl* in Surah Maryam in *Tafsir al-Mishbāh*.

This explanation motivates the author to study more deeply the elements of *al-dakhīl* contained in *Tafsir al-Mishbāh*, especially in Surah Maryam. This surah contains beautiful stories about the Prophets Zakariyya AS, Maryam, Isa AS, Ibrahim AS, Ishaq AS, Ya'qub AS, Musa AS, Harun AS, Isma'il AS, and Idris AS, with an emphasis on the blessings bestowed by Allah. to them. By analyzing Quraish Shihab's interpretation of this surah, this research aims to provide a more critical understanding of this interpretation, so that people can understand the verses of the Qur'an more wisely and in accordance with the correct rules of interpretation.

## METHODS

This research uses a qualitative approach, which aims to examine the condition of objects naturally with the researcher acting as the main instrument (Pare & Habsy, 2024; Tjendra et al., 2024). Data collection was carried out through triangulation or a combination of various sources, with analysis being inductive and emphasizing meaning rather than generalization (Manu & Fallo, 2022; Muryati & Hariyanti, 2024; Wardah et al., 2024).

The method used is library research, which involves collecting data from various sources related to *al-dakhīl* in *tafsir*. There are two data sources, namely primary and secondary data (Hertanto et al., 2019; Rusdi, 2019). The primary data sources for this research are the Koran and the book *Tafsir al-Mishbāh* by Muhammad Quraish Shihab. Meanwhile, secondary data sources include books, scriptures, journals and articles that are relevant to the discussion of *al-dakhīl* in *Tafsir al-Mishbāh* (Analytical Study of Surah Maryam).



"He (*Jibril*) called to him from a low place, "Do not be sad. Indeed, your Lord has made a river beneath you." (Maryam/19:24)

According to the author's analysis, what Muhammad Quraish Shihab explained in his interpretation is included in *al-dakhil bi al-ra'yi* regarding the date of birth of the Prophet Isa (AS), which he took from the Old Testament and the New Testament as references for his interpretation. This is a problem because, as is known, these two books are no longer original and have undergone many distortions and changes so that their contents can no longer be completely trusted, both in terms of monotheism, the Shari'a, and the stories of the prophets and apostles.

Historians say that the Prophet Isa a.s. It is estimated that he was born between 7 and 5 BC. However, there is no definite information about his birth date, including December 25 which is believed by Christians and celebrated as Christmas Day. The Qur'an and hadith do not mention the exact date of birth of the Prophet Isa (AS), so this information should not be used as a basis for belief by Muslims.

#### D. Maryam yang Diduga Saudara Harun (Q.S. Maryam Ayat 27–28)

فَأْتَتْ بِهِ قَوْمَهَا تَحْمِلُهُ قَالُوا لِمَ زِمْتِ لَقَدْ جِئْتِ شَيْئًا فَرِيًّا يَا خَتَّ هُرُونَ مَا كَانَ أَبُوكَ  
أَمْرًا سَوَاءً وَمَا كَانَتْ أُمُّكَ بَغِيًّا

"She (*Maryam*) took him (*the baby*) to her people holding him. They (*her people*) said, "O *Maryam*, indeed, you have really brought something very wrong. O sister of Harun (*Maryam*), your father was not a person with a bad temper and your mother was not an adulteress." (Maryam/19:27-28)

According to the author's analysis, what Muhammad Quraish Shihab included in his tafsir is included in *al-dakhil bi al-ra'yi*. This is because he quoted the opinion of an orientalist named Reland, who stated that the Prophet Muhammad SAW did not know history. This opinion is an insult to the Prophet Muhammad SAW and is baseless.

The phrase "Ya ukht Harun" (O sister of Harun) contained in this verse does not mean that Maryam was the biological sister of the Prophet Harun a.s. Wahbah al-Zuhaili, in his interpretation, explains that this expression is used to equate the nature of Maryam's worship and piety with Harun, a prophet who was known as a devout figure of worship. This is similar to the tradition of the Children of Israel, who often call someone a prophet or a pious person to show their honor and glory.

The same history was mentioned by Imam Ahmad, who quoted the dialogue between al-Mughirah bin Syu'bah and the residents of Najran. They question the phrase "sister of Harun," even though the time gap between Prophet Musa (a.s.) and Prophet Isa a.s. very long. Al-Mughirah bin Syu'bah asked this question to Rasulullah SAW, who answered that previous people used to use the names of prophets and pious people before them as symbols of goodness and piety.

Shaykh Muhammad Ali al-Shabuni also supports this interpretation, stating that the meaning of "sister of Harun" is Maryam's similarity to Harun in terms of worship and piety. This was also confirmed by Imam Qatadah, who explained that the Harun in question was not the brother of the Prophet Musa (AS), but a pious man from the Children of Israel who had the same name. This opinion was strengthened by al-Suhaili, who stated that the distance between Prophet Musa a.s. and Prophet Isa a.s. reaches around 1000 years, so it is impossible for Maryam to be the biological sister of Prophet Harun a.s.

Thus, the phrase "sister of Harun" is a figurative form used to show the superiority of Maryam (AS), not referring to the biological relationship of siblings. A more moderate interpretation based on authoritative Islamic literature needs to be put forward so that there are no misunderstandings in understanding this verse.

#### E. Saying Merry Christmas (Q.S. Maryam Verse 33)

## وَالسَّلَامُ عَلَيَّ يَوْمَ وُلِدْتُ وَيَوْمَ أَمُوتُ وَيَوْمَ أُبْعَثُ حَيًّا

"May prosperity be bestowed upon me on the day I was born, the day I died, and the day I was raised alive (again)." (Maryam/19:33)

Muhammad Quraish Shihab stated that wishing Christians a Merry Christmas is permissible as long as it does not damage a Muslim's faith. He related his views to the verses that mention the welfare of the Prophet Isa (AS). on the day of his birth.

However, according to the author's analysis, this view is classified as al-dakhil bi al-ra'yi. Merry Christmas greetings in the modern context are closely related to celebrations that contain the belief in the divinity of Isa (as), which clearly contradicts Islamic beliefs. Imam Ibnu Kathir explained that the welfare of the Prophet Isa a.s. in this verse it refers more to his servanthood to Allah SWT, not as a justification for congratulating him on his birth in the context of Christian beliefs. Therefore, Muhammad Quraish Shihab's views need to be reviewed so as not to cause confusion in the understanding of Islamic beliefs.

### F. Permohonan Ampun Nabi Ibrahim a.s. untuk Ayahnya (Q.S. Maryam Ayat 47)

## سَلِّمْ عَلَيْكَ سَأَسْتَغْفِرُ لَكَ رَبِّي إِنَّهُ كَانَ بِي حَفِيًّا

"He (Ibrahim) said, "May peace be upon you. I will ask my God for forgiveness for you. Indeed, He is kind to me." (Maryam/19:47)

Muhammad Quraish Shihab explained that asking forgiveness for polytheists was initially permitted, as was done by the Prophet Ibrahim a.s. However, according to the author's analysis, this opinion is classified as al-dakhil bi al-ra'yi, because Islamic law brought by the Prophet Muhammad SAW strictly prohibits asking forgiveness for polytheists, as mentioned in Surah At-Taubah: 113–114.

Ibnu Kathir also emphasized that Prophet Ibrahim AS's request for forgiveness. for his father, it was finally stopped after Allah SWT lowered the prohibition. This interpretation emphasizes that Muslims are obliged to follow the rules of sharia which are clearly stipulated in the Koran and Sunnah.

## CONCLUSION

This research analyzes the concept of al-dakhil in Tafsir al-Mishbah by Muhammad Quraish Shihab, with a focus on Surah Maryam. Several views in this interpretation, such as the name of the wife of Prophet Zakariyya AS, the age of Prophet Zakariyya AS. and his wife, the date of birth of the Prophet Isa (a.s.), as well as the use of the phrase "brother of Harun," are identified as forms of al-dakhil bi al-ma'tsur as well as al-dakhil bi al-ra'yi. The sources used, including the Old Testament and Orientalist opinions, cannot be fully justified scientifically according to Islamic literature. These findings emphasize the need for caution in citing information from non-Islamic traditions and in interpreting the Qur'an based on inauthentic narratives.

The main thing shows the importance of referring to authoritative Islamic sources to avoid misunderstandings and potential distortion of the creed. Interpretations that are not supported by authentic evidence can cause confusion among the people, such as views regarding Christmas greetings and requests for forgiveness for polytheists. Thus, a more moderate approach based on Islamic literature is needed so that interpretation remains relevant, accurate and does not conflict with the principles of monotheism and Islamic law.

## REFERENCES

Abdullah, A. (2017). Metodologi Penelitian, Corak Dan Pendekatan Tafsir Al Qur'an. *AL-*

- Aisyah, A. (2021). Menelaah Mahakarya Muhammad Quraish Shihab: Kajian Metodologis dan Penafsirannya dalam Tafsir Al Misbah. *Ulumul Qur'an: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir*, 1(1), 43–65.
- Akbar, A. I., & Riyadi, A. K. (2022). Pertentangan Antara Wahyu Dan Akal Sebagai Al-Dakhil Dalam Tafsir: Kajian Terhadap Kitab Dar'Ta 'arud Karya Ibn Taymiyah. *Qof*, 6(2), 267–284.
- Atabik, A. (2016). Corak tafsir aqidah (kajian komparatif penafsiran ayat-ayat aqidah). *ESENSIA: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 17(2), 209–223.
- Efha, N. F. M. (2019). *Ad-Dakhil Dalam Tafsir Al-Ibriz Karya Bisri Mustafa (Studi Analisis Terhadap QS. Al-Kahf dan QS. Maryam)* [Skripsi, Institut Ilmu Al Quran (IIQ) Jakarta].
- Fauziah, F. (2018). *Ad-Dakhil dalam Tafsir al-Khazin (Analisa ad- Dakhil pada Ayat-Ayat Kisah di Surab an-Naml)* [Skripsi, Institut Ilmu Al Quran (IIQ) Jakarta].
- Hasanah, N., Agung, A. A., & Putra, M. I. I. (2022). Ad-Dakhil dalam Surah Al-Anbiya' Ayat 83-84 (Studi Kitab Tafsir Al-Khazin). *Salimiya: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Keagamaan Islam*, 3(3), 53–63.
- Hasibuan, U. K., Ulya, R. F., & Jendri, J. (2020). Tipologi Kajian Tafsir: Metode, Pendekatan dan Corak dalam Mitra Penafsiran al-Qur'an. *Isblab: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin, Adab dan Dakwah*, 2(2), 224–248.
- Hertanto, H. B., Radhiyastama, C., Pamungkas, L. A., Prasetyo, H., & Ibriza, B. (2019). Street children behavior in criminology perspective (study of salatiga city). *Law Research Review Quarterly*, 5(2), 233–258.
- Idola, N. (2022). *Ad-Dakhil Dalam Tafsir Al-Mishbah Karya M. Quraish Shihab (Kajian Perspektif Tentang Ayat-ayat Kisah dan Hukum)* [Skripsi, Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau].
- Manu, G. A., & Fallo, D. Y. A. (2022). Pemanfaatan Slims (Senayan Library Management System) Sebagai E-Library Di Universitas Citra Bangsa. *HINEF: Jurnal Rumpun Ilmu Pendidikan*, 1(1), 15–25.
- Mujahidin, A., & Khoiriyah, Z. F. (2018). Konsep Pendidikan Prenatal dalam Perspektif Tafsir Al-Mishbah Karya M. Quraish Shihab. *Ta'allum: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 6(1), 1–121.
- Muryati, M., & Hariyanti, H. (2024). Mengembangkan Keterampilan Literasi Agama: Kontribusi Guru PAI dalam Pengenalan Al-Qur'an kepada Siswa Kelas I Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Inovasi Pendidikan*, 2(2), 108–122.
- Musa, N. (2024). Kontekstualisasi Dinamis Tafsir Al-Qur'an Indonesia: Studi Perbandingan Tafsir Al-Azhar dan Tafsir Al-Mishbah Tentang Kisah. *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu al-Qur'an dan Hadis Vol*, 25(2), 221–246.
- Nur, A. (2018). *Tafsir Al-Mishbah Dalam Sorotan: Kritik Terhadap Karya Tafsir M. Quraish Shihab*. Pustaka Al-Kautsar.
- Pare, N., & Habsy, B. A. (2024). Teori Dan Praktik Konseling Reality Therapy: Tinjauan Literatur. *Jurnal Psikologi Revolusioner*, 8(10).

- Purwaningrum, D., & Muhammad, H. N. (2022). Corak Adabi Ijtima'i Dalam Kajian Tafsir Indonesia (Studi Pustaka Tafsir Al-Misbah Dantafsir Al-Azhar). *Al Muhafidz: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir*, 2(1), 15–27.
- Rifah, A. F. (2023). Tafsir Al-Qur'an Surah Al-Ikhlās Karya M. Quraish Shihab: Studi Komparatif Terhadap Metodologi Tafsir Al-Mishbāh dan Tafsir Al-Qur'an Al-Karim. *Jurnal Tafsire*, 11(1), 78–91.
- Rusdi, M. (2019). Strategi Pemasaran untuk Meningkatkan Volume Penjualan pada Perusahaan Genting UD. Berkah Jaya. *Jurnal Studi Manajemen Dan Bisnis*, 6(2), 83–88.
- Shihab, M. Q. (2017). *Tafsir al-Misbah Pesan, Kesan Dan Keserasian al-Qur'an Vol. VII* (Revisi). Lentera Hati.
- Sholihah, D. N., Fansuri, F., & Hakim, M. F. (2024). Kontekstualisasi Mufasir Nusantara Dan Timur Tengah Terhadap Kata Syura. *Tasamub: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 16(1), 1–22.
- Sulthoni, A. (2019). Hermeneutika Al-Quran Prespektif Ad-Dakhil Fi at-Tafsir. *Al Karima: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Al Quran dan Tafsir*, 3(2), 1–21.
- Tjendra, M. J., Setiawan, T., & Riswandari, E. (2024). Analisis Faktor-Faktor yang Memengaruhi Tindakan Penggelapan Pajak (Studi Literatur Tahun 2018-2023). *Owner: Riset Dan Jurnal Akuntansi*, 8(3), Article 3. <https://doi.org/10.33395/owner.v8i3.2145>
- Ulinuha, M. (2017). Konsep Al-Ashil Dan Al-Dakhil Dalam Tafsir Alquran. *Jurnal Madania*, 21(2).
- Wardah, S. N., Nurjanah, N., & Suryadi, D. (2024). Systematic Literature Review: Analisis Tipe Kepribadian Extrovert dan Introvert Terhadap Kemampuan Matematis Siswa. *Indiktika: Jurnal Inovasi Pendidikan Matematika*, 6(2), 294–306.

**Copyright holder :**

© Aini, F. N., Nurfajiani, Suhefri, Irfan, M., Langputeh, S.

**First publication right:**

Al-Misbah: Journal of the Quran, Hadith and Tafseer

**This article is licensed under:**

**CC-BY-SA**